Reviewers report

Title: Partial Isolated Rupture of the popliteus tendon in a professional athlete. A case report

Version: 1 Date: 18 June 2009

Reviewer number: 1

Reviewers report:

The manuscript titled “Partial Isolated Rupture of the popliteus tendon in a professional athlete. A case report” from Prof. Mariani and Prof. Margheritini, is very interesting case report.

My additional remarks are:

1- The main topic is about “partial popliteus tendon rupture” but at the introduction part the authors can remind the anatomy of the popliteus tendon (not obligatory, but necessary, I think). The articles about variations of the popliteus tendon “bifurcate popliteus tendon” (LP Carro Arthroscopy 1999) and “Three-bundle popliteus tendon: a non symptomatic anatomical variation”. (Doral MN et al. Knee. 2006 Aug;13, 4 : 342-3) can be attractive.

2- At the paragraph of case report, line 8; needs to clarify differential diagnosis like, iliotibial tract syndrome, biceps femoris tendinitis, symptomatic cystema (Mishra AK, Arthroscopy 1996), snapping popliteus tendon syndrome (DE Cooper, AJSM 1999).

3- At the paragraph of case report, line 9; ……the pain was more sharp at popliteus Groove…….. needs, which kind of tests were applied? (like figure of four test, Garrick and Webb test).

4- At the paragraph of case report, line 19; …….the tendon was tested with and external rotatory force applied to the tibia…….; reference of Staubli’s manuscript is important; Arthroscopy 1990.

Finally in this manuscript the clinical tests and MRI findings (not easy to evaluate) were most important key points.

According to my opinion the authors may focus on those four important parameters above with a very short supplement.

After these personal additional remarks, do not hesitate to publish this case report.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable