Reviewer's report

Title: Relationships between foot type and dynamic rearfoot frontal plane motion

Version: 2 Date: 23 December 2009

Reviewer: Anthony Redmond

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions

Unfortunately, the author has created a new problem with this revision, having provided a mix of correlations from raw FPI data and linear regressions from logit transformed data.

Most obviously:

a) this means that the r squared value from the regression models is higher than the r value from the correlation analysis

b) it is not clear why, having gone to the trouble of obtaining the logit values these are not used throughout in the analysis. Although Pearson's is recognized as being fairly robust when used on ordinal data, the assumptions are being stretched in using it on the raw ordinal data when there is no need to do so.

The paper is well written and the overall content is of merit. The analysis does need to be revisited however, although this need not be especially onerous. It would seem that it would be sufficient for the same few analyses to be repeated but using the logit transformed FPI data. I would not anticipate that this would change the overall findings to any great extent but it would provide a more robust and coherent analysis on which to hang the rest of the story.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests