Reviewer's report

Title: Birt-Hogg-Dube renal tumors are genetically distinct from other renal neoplasias and are associated with up-regulation of mitochondrial gene expression

Version: 1 Date: 7 August 2010

Reviewer: Takeshi kishida

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
No major revisions indicated.

- Minor Essential Revisions

Page 6 line 33
What is MSigDB ?

Page 9 line 25
This observation is that it has recently,.....

In fig 4C, I could not see difference between control and PGC-1# overexpressed cells. The authors were requested to make it clear.

- Discretionary Revisions

In introducing the previous study in molecular genetic change in BHD derived tumors, the author should include the study by Murakami et al. that also study gene expression profile of BHD tumors and sporadic tumors.

Identification and characterization of Birt-Hogg-Dubé associated renal carcinoma.
J Pathol. 2007 Apr;211(5):524-31

The specific gene expression such as mitochondrial gene in these tumors has been shown very beautifully. How is the expression in protein level? At least, the author should discuss about that and refer to the paper listed below.

Molecular pathology of renal oncocytoma: a review.
Yusenko MV.


Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'