Reviewer’s report

Title: Genotator: A comprehensive disease-agnostic tool for genetic annotation of disease

Version: 1 Date: 29 July 2010

Reviewer: Wei Yu

Reviewer’s report:

This manuscript described a bioinformatics tool that produces a list of candidate genes for a disease/disorder by collecting the data from 11 common genetic databases. Such tool might be useful for genomics research community.

Major Compulsory Revisions
1. The scoring formula relies heavily on Yes/No labels from GAD. To my knowledge, GAD only added a few records since 2008, meaning that GAD has not updated their data. How do you address this problem?

2. I tried a couple of examples using both Genotator and Gene Prospector. It seems that the returning results were quite similar. What is the added value of Genotator over Gene Prospector in terms of prioritization of the candidate genes?

3. Since the parameters constants in the formula were obtained based on the two test cases (autism and Parkinson). I am afraid they might cause over fitting issue. Try a different case (for example, Alzheimer and compared with Top gene list from Alzgene (http://www.alzgene.org/)) with the same set of the parameters and see how the tool performs.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.