Reviewer's report

Title: An approach to analyse the specific impact of rapamycin on mRNA-ribosome association ex-Vivo.

Version: 2 Date: 21 May 2008

Reviewer: Laura Beretta

Reviewer's report:

Although the authors addressed satisfactorily some of the issues that were raised in the first review, the authors chose not to address some of the other issues experimentally.

This definition of ex-vivo will not be shared by many.

The concern with figure 1 (WB) has not been addressed as requested in the initial review (the same figure is shown). Lane 2 is overloaded and this has not been addressed in the authors’ reply. Using the total anti-4E-BP1 antibody and, despite the authors’ arguments, lane 4 does show a lower electrophoretic mobility shift than lane 1, which likely suggests hyperphosphorylation upon rapamycin treatment. Therefore, this figure is not convincing.

The issue of the rapamycin concentration has not been addressed properly. It should be at least clearly acknowledged in the discussion section that this concentration may lead to results that are useful for developing this method, but that may not be biologically relevant.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.