Reviewer's report

Title: Scapula fractures in complex shoulder injuries: A classification based on dislocation and instability

Version: 1 Date: 24 July 2014

Reviewer: Peter Biberthaler

Reviewer's report:

The authors address a very relevant aspect for the scientific approach to the rare injury “floating shoulder”. They observe that there is no sufficient classification neither for scientific questions, nor for the decision for conservative or surgical treatment, nor for the choice of operative treatment and particularly not the basis for an algorithm. The authors have retrospectively evaluated a high number of 107 patients with “floating shoulder” from 2003 to 2010, who were treated in their single trauma center and received a CT scan of the shoulder with 3D reconstruction. The authors suggest a classification in A, B and C injuries that goes far beyond the Euler-Rüedi classification of scapula fractures.

Minor Essential Revisions:

The authors should describe the difference to the mentioned classification in detail. Furthermore, there are no percentages and confidence interval shown in table 1. Moreover, the term “floating shoulder” should be part of the title.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.