Reviewer’s report

Title: Video-assisted thoracoscopic surgical lobectomy of fissureless congenital cystic adenomatoid malformation: a case report

Version: 3 Date: 12 October 2014

Reviewer: Zacharias Zachariah

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Other

If other, please specify:

A new approach that should be discussed more critically

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This report addresses 2 aspects:

1. In such cases, as the authors correctly suggest, it is absolutely necessary to perform a meticulous preoperative diagnostic procedure in order to know beforehand what the anatomy is.

2. It is feasible to perform this operation video assisted.

For the first aspect it is worth publishing this article that indicates the necessity for good preoperative diagnosis.
For the second aspect, in my opinion the authors have to critically report if the method applied is really beneficial for the patient. They performed a nearly 6 cm thoracotomy and used 2 ports in addition and the operation lasted over 5 hrs. In my experience this operation could have been performed with the same results through one thoracotomy of about 10 cm and in half of the time.

This paper could be considered for publication after revision and critical discussion if VATS is the appropriate approach in this case.

The text should be corrected by a native speaker.

This report could be shortened especially the discussion where methods that were not used in this case are discussed.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests