Reviewer's report

Title: Video-assisted thoracoscopic surgical lobectomy of fissureless congenital cystic adenomatoid malformation: a case report

Version: 3  Date: 5 October 2014

Reviewer: Holger Till

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: None

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This is certainly a nice case report about the benefits of CT-planning before thoracoscopic resection of a CPAM (the new term for CCAM:::).

However as paediatric surgeons we consider a 5.5cm incision almost a "real thoracotomy", even in a 14 year old girl. This large incision allowed for the introduction of several instruments and stay sutures we usually don't see in a "real thoracoscopic resection (with 5mm scope and two 3-5mm working ports!) as seen in the figures.

So I would suggest to focus on the radiological work-up, even in the title....

Finally I would suggest to quote Rothenberg SS, JLAST 2011 because of his
substantial experience in this field!

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests