Reviewer’s report

Title: Paget's disease of the Bone localized in the jaw of a young female

Version: 1 Date: 1 October 2013

Reviewer: marie-Hélène vieillard

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

- General comments

This paper reports a single observation of mandibular Paget disease. The originality of this paper is the location of the disease and the age of onset, both very atypical.

However, neither the clinic nor the high level of markers of bone turnover, or the bone scintigraphy and spect-CT presented in this article are specific to Paget's disease. Histological examination is not concordant between the 2 biopsies. The analgesic bone response after treatment with zoledronic acid is not specific for Paget's disease. So it is very difficult to confirm Paget's disease on the data presented in this article.

First, it would be interesting to verify the absence of any other localization on the
skeleton, including the lower limbs.

Then, it is essential to discuss the differential diagnosis and in particular fibrous dysplasia, most common at this age and whose appearance, particularly in the jaw, is very close to that of Paget’s disease.

The illustration should be complete with radiograph and a CT-scan of the jaw to highlight the features and atypical appearance of the localization on the mandible of Pagetic disease and to the differential diagnosis with fibrous dysplasia or other anomaly of bone structure.

Finally, the use of zoledronate in this age can also be discussed, the pamidronate could have been proposed

- Revisions necessary for publication
This case report needs more information to be suitable for publication.

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests