Reviewer's report

**Title:** Exertional fat embolism post-hip joint replacement - a case report

**Version:** 3  **Date:** 2 October 2014

**Reviewer:** Rahul Patel

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

**Comments to authors:**

This is a very interesting report. The source of such a shower of emboli at these time intervals following surgery is difficult to establish, but the findings of fat emboli are persuasive. To exclude a venous source from the right lower limb / right heart return venous system, I suspect a venography study would have been indicated. There is a possibility of a thrombus in the system that could have been discharging embolic like material post op. It is unlikely that the THR is still mediating embolism as long as the implant is stable? Comment on these two aspects is advised.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'