Reviewer’s report

Title: Monoaural Musical Hallucinations caused by a Thalamocortical Auditory Radiation Lacunar Infarct

Version: 2 Date: 17 September 2014

Reviewer: Dali Yin

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: No

Comments to authors:

In this manuscript, Woo et al present an 85-year-old female patient who developed acute onset of musical hallucination and was diagnosed with sublenticular lacunar infarct of the thalamocortical auditory radiation in the right non-dominant hemisphere. The authors suggested all patients with monoaural musical hallucinations should have brain imaging to rule out a central organic cause. Overall, this case report is interesting. There are minor issues that need to be addressed. (1) Add references for the statements based on other published papers in the INTRODUCTION. (2) Add page number. It would be nice to see the patient’s symptom improve or disappear after treatment.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests