Reviewer's report

Title: Posterior Mediastinal Ganglioneuroma with Peripheral Replacement by White and Brown Adipocytes: One case report

Version: 1 Date: 21 June 2014

Reviewer: A PONNUSWAMY

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Re: 'Posterior Mediastinal Ganglioneuroma with Peripheral Replacement by White and Brown Adipocytes: One case report'
Journal of Medical Case Reports

Thanks for asking me to review this case report.

The case report has been submitted in systematic format and highlights an important aspect of Ganglioneuroma i.e., the process of adipogenesis within the tumour and the diagnostic fallacy with regards to false positive FDG PET scan results in a reportedly benign disease.

The authors I feel wish to highlight this aspect of the diagnostic management of Ganglioneuroma. This however is not very clearly impressed upon in the case
The paper adds to the current knowledge that there exists a pathogenic process of adipose change in tumours. This case report has also attempted to highlight the importance of FDG positivity despite a benign histology on biopsy in this unusual mass in the lung.

Presentation
The title may need revision after the authors have reviewed the main story from the report i.e. is it the brown adipocyte change or the diagnostic fallacy with FDG positivity and benign aetiology in resected.
The case report seems logically constructed but lacks explicit information with regards to why the clinicians decide to go for resection.
Report seems appropriate in word-counts and images.
The written style seems slightly incongruable.

Abstract
The abstract seems to conforms to the journal’s published guidelines for authors and seems to be describing the case and the condition.
The key words listed seem appropriate.

Introduction
The literature review doesn’t seem to include a key paper from Japan itself with the similar features described in a patient with Ganglioneuroma.

[A case of posterior mediastinal Ganglioneuroma with fat tissue].

Clinical Report
In the clinical presentation para 1 sentence 4, the mass had not changed successfully ..... How and what happened to the mass are there serial imaging to clarify.
Sentence 5 to bee rephrased
Sentence 7 states lab test unremarkable but why has phaeochromocytoma screening not been done with a Background of hypertension.
Sentence 7 also uses abbreviations SCC, CEA, CYFRA this should be expanded.

In the details of follow up and after care given the report mentions a 3 month hospital stay is there a reason for such a prolonged stay,

Discussion
Sentence 5 starting at the represent .....should be rephrased unable to comprehend the message there.
3rd paragraph sentence 8 starting Microscopically in the grayish should probably read greyish

Conclusions

Acknowledgements
I have not seen a statement of conflict of interest.
Unclear if the patient’s consent been obtained for their inclusion in the report

References
I feel these following references must be reviewed and used appropriately

[Ganglioneuroma of the mediastinum. Apropos of a case].

[Adrenal ganglioneuroma: report of a case].
(PMID:8073957) Iwamoto Y, Ueda H, Suzuki T, Tonami H, Takasaki N, Kotani T

[Adrenal ganglioneuroma: a case report].

[Ganglioneuroma arising in the adrenal medulla: a case report].
(PMID:9503205) Ito H, Fuse H, Hirano S, Masuda S, Koshida H

Multiple ganglioneuromas: a report of a case and review of the ganglioneuromas.

Mediastinal tumors of peripheral nervous system origin.
(PMID:10355655) Marchevsky AM
Seminars in diagnostic pathology [1999 Feb;16(1):65-78]

Presacral ganglioneuroma: a case report and review of literature.

Malignant smooth muscle tumors presenting as mediastinal soft tissue masses.

Fat attenuation lesions of the mediastinum. (PMID:11711800) Boiselle PM, Rosado-de-Christenson ML Journal of computer assisted tomography [2001 Nov-Dec;25(6):881-9]


**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:** None declared