Reviewer's report

Title: Ruptured Aneurysm at the Fenestration of the Middle Cerebral Artery Detected by Magnetic Resonance Angiography in a Patient with Systemic Lupus Erythematosus and Renal Failure: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 7 November 2013

Reviewer: Yeoungjee Cho

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Thank you for an interesting case. Authors describe an uncommon complication of SLE in a 47-year old female who presented with SAH from ruptured aneurysm from fenestration of the MCA. The manuscript is clearly written, but I have a few concerns that require clarification:

1. It is difficult to ascertain the level of SLE activity or any measures were taken to exclude other causes of aneurysm.

2. I do not agree with the last sentence, where "as the prognosis of SLE patients is usually poor, both diagnosis and therapy were difficult and important in such conditions" - SLE is a treatable condition. Although prognosis can be poor in some, if compliant and on correct treatment, it is a manageable condition albeit
may not curable. If the sentence refers to SAH pts with SLE, then it should be more explicitly clarified.

3. It would also be helpful to define what hte level of chronic renal failure was - given CT with contrast was contraindicated.

Quality of written English: Acceptable