Reviewer's report

Title: Unilateral hippocampal infarction revealed following an attempted suicide: A case report

Version: 2 Date: 1 March 2014

Reviewer: Takeshi Sasaki

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The authors described a case of unilateral hippocampal infarction, which was revealed by diffusion weighted imaging performed after the admission due to the patient’s attempted suicide.

Based on the case, they emphasized the importance of examining organic factors of patients with suicidal behaviors whose abnormal behaviors could wrongly and entirely be attributed to psychiatric conditions such as depression.

This is a valuable case report worth publishing, but there are some points requiring clarification.

The onset of infarction was not clearly described. Was it before the admission, or after? The patient started having memory deficit after the admission, which could
indicate that the onset of infarction was after the admission. But in the introduction section, the authors suggested that the attempted suicide itself could be “due to” hippocampal infarction. This is a bit confusing to the readers and needs to be clarified.

If the onset of infarction was the after the admission, which indicates that the patient was depressed before the admission, providing more detailed information regarding the depression such as medication would enhance the understanding of the case for readers.

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests:**

No competing interests.