Reviewer's report

Title: Unusual Implant-Related Soft Tissue Reaction: A Case Report

Version: 2 Date: 14 March 2014

Reviewer: Mohammad Ghasemi-rad

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Dear Author,

This is interesting presentation for a foreign body reaction. It is well presented and well explained. I have some question that will be brought by any one that reads your report.

1. The introduction part of abstract is vague and should be rephrased. Especially moving from the reaction to Hyditis cyst and sarcomas.
2. Why the trochanteric specimen was not sent for histopathological examination?
3. Which strain of coagulase negative, Methicillin sensitive staph were isolated?
4. What type of implant material (metal) was used for the patient? This is to clarify if you are still using the same implants or those were only used during that time and we should no more expect this reactions.
5-Why did you directly went for biopsy? Why not any other imaging report prior to that? Also you have no imaging in your figures which can help the next doctor facing the same situation to have this typical images in mind before proceeding to more invasive procedures.

6-Why is ESR so high? A normal foreign body reaction should not increase the ESR to more that 100?

7- the pathology figures should have scale bar???

Manuscript should undergo minor language corrections.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I hereby declare that I have not in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this paper, either now or in the future. I do not hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this paper, either now or in the future. I do not hold or are currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript. I also declare that I don't have any other financial competing interests and do not have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper.