Reviewer's report

Title: Chronic periarteritis (retroperitoneal fibrosis) concurrent with Giant Cell Arteritis. Is it an unusual coexistence?

Version: 1 Date: 10 February 2014

Reviewer: Christian Agard

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: No

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General comments:
This is an interesting and original case describing coexistence of GCA with RPF in a 47y-old woman.
It would have been relevant to perform arterial Doppler sonography, PET or any other vascular investigations of all the large-sized vessels. If it has been performed, results should be included and discussed.
The age of 47 is quiet young for GCA.

Revisions necessary for publication:
- The description of patient's outcome under steroid should be included in the "case presentation" section.
- page 3: Did the author search for ANCA? anti-nuclear antibodies?
- page 4: It should be indicated how the authors made them sure that other causes of RPF were ruled out (tumor, infection...)
- page 4: the dosage of prednisolone is lacking. How long was the treatment?
- Page 4: The authors describe two variants of GCA. This can be the case but many patients do have aortitis and temporal arteritis. The dichotomy is not so simple.
- page 5: the authors use the term "autoimmune"...it is not completely clear if GCA has to be considered as an auto-immune disease.
- The conclusion has to be re-written as it appears much more like points to discuss than a real conclusion of the report.
- The English language has to be improved.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

No competing interests