Reviewer's report

Title: Single Incision Laparoscopic Total Extraperitoneal Repair for Grynfeltt Hernia: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 17 September 2013

Reviewer: ABDULZAHRA HUSSAIN

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Other

If other, please specify:

New technique for uncommon pathology

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

1. Laparoscopic repair of lumbar hernia is first reported by Heniford group from USA in 1997 Laparoscopic Inferior and Superior Lumbar Hernia Repair

B. Todd Heniford, MD; David A. Iannitti, MD; Michel Gagner, MD

Heniford reported TAPP method of repair. This technique should also be highlighted in the discussion and authors need to compare the differences to give
the reader full scope of management options.

2. Minimal access approach, of course is better than traditional big incision with its complications of pain, infection, seroma, recurrence and long recovery.

3. The authors need to explain why they choose this position, location of trocars and the site of incision.

4. The authors also should explain why they kept the patient for 4 days which is long hospitalization following laparoscopic surgery.

5. We are doing abdominal hernia (including lumber one) as a day surgery case using TAPP technique which provide advantage of diagnostic laparoscopy. The TAPP technique can be performed using one 10mm port for introduction of the mesh and two 5mms ports for working instruments. which mean total incisions length is 20mms.

6. The inherent weakness of reporting hernia case is the follow up. The longest the follow up the higher the recurrence. 6 months is short follow up.

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I have no conflict of any type