Reviewer's report

Title: Surgical management of retrorectal cystic hamartoma (tailgut cyst) using transrectal approach: a case report and review of the literature

Version: 1 Date: 23 August 2013

Reviewer: Luis Fariña

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Other

If other, please specify:
An unusual surgical approach to a rare disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The aim of this Case report is to present the anterior transrectal approach in the treatment of retrorectal tumors, but a description of the general procedure or the technic applied in this particular patient can not be found, either in the text of the “Case presentation” section or in the “Discussion” section.

For the reader interested in technical details and their indications, there is not a single reference in the attached “References” that relates to previous papers dealing with the anterior transrectal technique.
In the “Discussion” section, there is an overview of the anatomy, tumor types, clinical and imaging diagnosis and treatment of retrorectal tumors, which is too long and not particularly related to the case reported by the authors.

Figures 2a and 2b are difficult to interpret and would need a better explanation in the foot note.

The term "caucasian" is inappropriate and uninteresting in this Case report (R.Bhopal and L.Donaldson 1998; MT Fullilove 1998).

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

No com`peting interests