Reviewer's report

Title: A unique combination of testicular seminomatous mixed germ cell tumor with choriocarcinoma and teratoma with secondary somatic malignancy

Version: 1 Date: 28 May 2013

Reviewer: Adam Zarkadoulias

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The manuscript is interesting and well written.

The authors describe a case of a mixed germ cell tumour with a unique combination of three components that has not been reported in the literature so far.

The following are my comments and questions to the authors.

1) The information of the lymph node status is missing.

2) Why was the patient unable to perform pulmonary function tests prior to chemotherapy? In addition it is not clear if bleomycin was omitted only for the first cycle of chemotherapy or through the entire treatment.

3) The details from the patient's last follow up should be mentioned in the case
4) The reported level of hCG following chemotherapy is not in the normal range as mentioned in the text.

5) There is no biopsy from the metastatic lesions in order to make the correct histologic diagnosis. Could the metastases consist of choriocarcinoma since it seems that there are only splanchic metastases with no lymph nodes and the hCG has not been normalised following chemotherapy or is it rhabdomyosarcoma? If it is rhabdomyosarcoma it would not probably respond well to cisplatin based chemotherapy.

6) The definition of teratoma with somatic malignancy would be helpful for the readers of the article.

7) The figures are not cited in the text.

8) On the title page, the title of the article should include the study design, i.e., a case report, in order to conform with the guide for authors.

9) The ethnicity of the patient should be added to the case presentation of the abstract according to the guide for authors.

10) Some minor type errors:
- p2, line 15: liver and spleen should not start with capital letters.
- p4, line 11: there is a "d" missing from the word epididymis.
- p5, line 17: wrong spelling of the word teratomatous.
- There are abbreviations used in the text that are not defined at first use, such as EMA, IHC, PLAP.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.