Reviewer’s report

Title: Infratentorial Benign Cystic Meningioma Mimicking A Hemangioblastoma Radiologically & A Pilocytic Astrocytoma Introperatively: Case Report

Version: 2 Date: 15 May 2012

Reviewer: Konstantin Slavin

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication? – yes – it requires intraoperative photograph

Is this case worth reporting? – may be

Is the case report persuasive? – not completely

Does the case report have diagnostic value? – may be

----------------------------

It would make a lot of difference in support of the title and text if there was a surgical illustration.