Reviewer's report

Title: Infratentorial Benign Cystic Meningioma Mimicking A Hemangioblastoma Radiologically & A Pilocytic Astrocytoma Introperatively: Case Report

Version: 2 Date: 9 May 2012

Reviewer: singh Avninder

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

1. You have written inline 104 that mitoses were seen and also focal atypia was seen. Please mention mitoses as number/hpf to exclude WHO grade 2 atypical meningioma

2. There are many typographical errors and they shoud be corrected for ex: words are joint in lines 121, 126, 141, 152

3. Better photomicrograph should be added before acceptance as it shows only a whorl and not a view of representative tumor morphology

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
no