Reviewer's report

Title: Subacute lymphocytic thyroiditis after lobectomy in a patient with papillary thyroid carcinoma: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 5 October 2012

Reviewer: rosaria ruggeri

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The Authors reported a case of a patient with subclinical lymphocytic thyroiditis who developed transient hyperthyroidism followed by hypothyroidism after a (surgery). Subclinical lymphocytic thyroiditis is considered a variant chronic autoimmune thyroiditis. It is clinically and pathologically similar to postpartum thyroiditis but occurs in the absence of pregnancy. A thyroidal insult (i.e., thyroid biopsy, neck surgery, ..) has been demonstrated to cause the onset of a subclinical lymphocytic thyroiditis. This is the first report of a subacute lymphocytic thyroiditis that develops after thyroid lobectomy.

The report is well-written and informative. I have only minor suggestions to propose.

1. Has the patient a family history of autoimmune thyroid disease, indicating that
she was genetically predisposed to develop such a disease? If yes, it is not surprising that she became hypothyroid.

2. What’s about the follow-up of this patient? The length of follow up should be clearly stated. In the Case Presentation section, the author do not say anything about. However, at the end of the Discussion section the Authors wrote: “Thyroid tests will reevaluate the patient in four to six weeks, and the levothyroxine will be discontinued after three to six months.” That is, there was no follow-up at the time the Authors wrote the manuscript. And now? In my opinion it is important to know if hypothyroidism is transient and not permanent?

3. Why the Author stated that “levothyroxine will be discontinued after three to six months”. The patient underwent surgery for a papillary microcarcinoma. In my opinion, the patient should be treated anyway with L-T4.

4. The authors might wish to review and reference the following papers


5. In Case Presentation Section, the biochemical data that are reported in Table 1 should be omitted from text.

6. Figure. Figure 2 should be delete.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published