Reviewer's report

Title: A complicated case of pachydermoperiostosis treated by zoledronic acid and arthroscopic synovectomy: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 5 September 2013

Reviewer: Norberto Ortego-Centeno

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Authors present an interesting case of pachydermoperiostosis treated with zoledronic acid and arthroscopic synovectomy.

I have some doubts about the case report:

1. When the patient was diagnosed with pachydermoperiostosis, he was treated with prednisone, methotrexate, salicylazosulfapyridine 2g/d, calcium and alendronic acid with poor response. Then, he was treated with intravenous zoledronate and knee joints synovectomy. It is unclear whether all treatment was withdrawn. If only alendronate was withdrawn it is possible that the benefit observed was due to the rest of the treatment.

2. The patient meets ASAS criteria for spondyloarthropathy. As the authors
comment the association between spondyloarthropathy and IgA nephropathy, is well known. Not so an association between pachydermoperiostosis and IgA nephropathy.

3. Recently it has been described some effect of zoledronic acid in spondyloarthropathies (Ann Rheum Dis. 2011 Jun;70(6):1091-4. doi: 10.1136/ard.2010.142539. Epub 2011 Feb 22), and probably this was the effect observed in the patient

I think the case probably could better be presented as an association between spondyloarthropathy and pachydermoperiostosis.

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable