Reviewer's report

Title: Sunitinib treatment enabling resection of massive liver metastasis: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 28 May 2013

Reviewer: Carolina D'Elia

Comments to authors:

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?
- New medical and surgical management of metastatic recurrent metastatic disease

Has the case been reported coherently?
- Yes, in my opinion, the case report has been coherently and clearly reported.

Is the case report authentic?
- I hope so.

Is the case report ethical?
- Yes, after sunitinib treatment patient has been treated following Guidelines, regarding liver metastasectomy (GR C).

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?
- Yes. I would add:
  - The histological subtype of the renal cell carcinoma: cRCC, pRCC, ch RCC?
  - The size of the primary tumor
  - The patient’s comorbidity, if present
  - An accurate classification of surgical complications (e.g. Clavien Dindo) and chemotherapy adverse events (e.g. National Cancer Institute Common Toxicity Criteria grading system for the adverse effects of cancer treatment)
  - Renal and liver function (pre and post CHT and surgery)

Is this case worth reporting?
- Yes

Is the case report persuasive?
- Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?
- Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?
- No, I think, that the management advantages and new options offered by this case report will prove more in treatment, rather than in the diagnosis.
Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?
- Yes; it is well known that metastasectomy of liver metastasis is associated with a significantly better overall survival compared with either partial resection or ablation.

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?
- Yes

Comments to authors:
The case report is really interesting and clearly reported, but, in introduction, I would specify, that resection for metastatic liver cancer has been reported as effective in colorectal cancer (ref. 1 and 2). Moreover, I would add a reference of FDA approval for metastatic renal cell carcinoma and GIST.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests'