Reviewer's report

Title: Esophageal rupture caused by explosion of automobile tire tube: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 25 March 2013

Reviewer: Daniel Dante Yeh

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Great job on presenting an unusual case of esophageal rupture. There are just a few minor clarifications that need to be made:

1) In the Introduction, please specify your exact search strategy.

2) In the Case Presentation, the final sentence of the first paragraph reads: "Chest X-ray examination indicated pulmonary compression..." Do you mean pulmonary contusion? The term pulmonary compression is unfamiliar to me.

3) "Closed drainage of the pleural cavity..." Please specify right or left pleural cavity.
4) Operative details - What was the time delay from injury to operation? What was the clinical status of the patient? What was the extent of contamination/inflammation at operation?

5) What was the duration of prophylactic antibiotic administration? Since this was a delayed treatment of an esophageal rupture which had presumably had ongoing contamination, wouldn't the proper term be therapeutic antibiotic treatment of mediastinitis rather than "prophylactic"?

6) In the Discussion, it may be helpful to include a brief paragraph about outcomes for esophageal trauma in general and for blunt esophageal rupture from all causes.

7) In the final paragraph of your Discussion, you state that positioning the esophagogastrosotomy in the neck has resulted in better surgical results. I would be care about making such a bold statement since, to the best of my knowledge, this is a controversial topic and the literature is divided.

8) There are several minor spelling and grammatical errors which I have pointed out in the attached PDF.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

No competing interests