Reviewer's report

Title: Early acute pancreatitis in a child with compound heterozygosis F508-del/R1438W/Y1032C cystic fibrosis: a case report.

Version: 4 Date: 21 May 2013

Reviewer: Shruti Paranjape

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This manuscript describes an interesting case for both this journal's readership and the CF community, specifically a case of pancreatitis in a 6 year old with pancreatic sufficient CF and three identified mutations. While informative, the emphasis on the presentation of acute pancreatitis is somewhat lost in the discussion of the identified gene mutations and the patient’s compound heterozygote genotype.

Title: The title of the case report clearly identifies the focus of the paper.

Abstract: The abstract nicely summarizes the content of the manuscript, but more emphasis should be placed on the presentation and description of acute pancreatitis in a 6 year old child with what was initially considered to be “mild” CF
based on the child’s medical history.

Case Presentation: The case presentation is comprehensive, but a few more details should be included to support some of the statements made about the patient, since the journal’s readership may not be familiar with clinical management in CF. For example, what were the patient’s growth parameters and BMI percentile for age? What assessments were done to justify the statement that “pancreatic and respiratory functions were normal” in the first 5 years of life? Was there a family history of other liver disease? What was the direct bilirubin measurement? Why was ursodeoxycholic acid used as part of the treatment for pancreatitis in this patient? What signs of “respiratory or digestive tract involvement” are absent to warrant the statement that the patient’s “general condition” is “good”?

Discussion: The discussion should be substantially restructured. In this reviewer’s opinion, the authors should focus more on the presentation of acute pancreatitis, emphasizing that it is present in a small proportion of patients with pancreatic sufficient CF. There should be some discussion of its prevalence, expected presentation, clinical diagnosis, and management. What is the reported age range in the CF population? This can be followed by a discussion of the mutations and genotype, and some discussion of genotype/phenotype correlation, which are relevant to this case presentation. It is interesting that two “rare” mutations (the frequencies were not explicitly specified) in combination with F508del cause “mild” disease, while the effects of the same two mutations are additive and cause more significant clinical issues in a pancreatic sufficient patient.

Conclusions: Based on the case presentation, the conclusion as stated is not in question, that the combination of these three specific mutations in this patient is disease-causing, but more emphasis should be placed on the child’s presentation with acute pancreatitis at age 6 years with a seemingly “mild” clinical phenotype. What are the lessons learned from this case for early recognition of acute pancreatitis in this patient population?

Format: The manuscript should be carefully edited and revised for language, sentence structure, and specifically defining the use of abbreviations (i.e., “PS” for “pancreatic sufficient”).

References: The references are appropriate in number and content.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

This reviewer has no competing interests to declare.