Reviewer’s report

Title: Clinical picture and treatment implication in a child with Capgras Syndrome: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 30 August 2012

Reviewer: George Christodoulou

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The definition quoted in the Introduction is wrong, for the following reasons:

If the patient himself or herself is replaced by someone else the resulting syndrome is the syndrome of subjective doubles (Christodoulou, GN, Syndrome of Subjective Doubles 135, 249-251, 1978).

The monothematic delusion usually concerns relatives but it is not restricted exclusively to the relatives.

Course and Prognosis of the syndrome is dealt with extensively in a paper incorporated in the book The Delusional Misidentification Syndromes, editor GN Christodoulou, Karger, Basel, 1986 where other relevant papers may enrich your awareness of the syndrome varieties and peculiar expression. I would also

Your paper is descriptive only. I would recommend broadening it with a brief discussion of the dynamics. What was the emotional relationship to the parents (since it was the parents who were the main misidentified persons). Was the delusion later extended to also include other persons, or inanimate objects? Was the delusion associated with reduplicative paramnesia (since the two conditions often co-exist)?

The clinical evaluation of the patient and the response to an antidepressant suggests the involvement of depression in the pathogenesis of the syndrome. In one of my publications I have reported that the cases in which the syndrome appears in a depressive setting have a better prognosis (because the syndrome follows the course of depression and is not so deeply rooted as is the case when the syndrome occurs in a paranoid setting).

I hope that these comments are helpful.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests