Reviewer's report

Title: Lung cancer presenting as a metastasis to the carpal bones: a case report.

Version: 1 Date: 18 December 2011

Reviewer: Karan Madan

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: None

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

There is lack of coherence and a large amount of missing information in the report.

The lung window section CT picture definitely does not show a large left upper lobe mass as mentioned in the manuscript.

The post surgical course of the patient is extremely dubious. One one hand the patient had developed marked constitutional symptoms at the time of diagnosis and still had a pretty unevenful further course for 6 months which is very unusual for advanced lung cancer.

TTF-1 positivity does not prove lung origin as a number of other tumors can show this marker positivity.

A PET-CT would have been a better diagnostic modality to look for other
possible primary sites.
No patient will be happy to lose one hand. The amputation might have relieved his pain but if that could have been achieved by other modalities like good analgesia or nerve blocks, he could have had a better quality of life.

What treatment did the patient receive for the primary disease? If at all, it was lung cancer then this presentation makes it a stage 4 disease the treatment of which is chemotherapy with best supportive care. No mention of that is there in the manuscript.
In addition chemotherapy along with analgesia might have avoided an amputation for the patient.
Why wasn't an FNAC attempted prior to open biopsy? It is much less invasive and has excellent diagnostic yield.

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests