Reviewer's report

Title: Lung cancer presenting as a metastasis to the carpal bones: a case report.

Version: 1 Date: 9 December 2011

Reviewer: Vijay Hadda

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

* Has the case been reported coherently?
  -No. The whole manuscript requires a thorough revision for grammar.

* Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?
  -Yes. What treatment was given to the patient for lung carcinoma?

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Authors have described an extremely rare presentation of lung carcinoma. As described rightly by authors the when metastasis present in this form it is extremely difficult to make a right a diagnosis. This case further highlights the fact that usual presentation of common disease can be disgusting sometime! Therefore, reporting of such cases are important. However, I would like to bring to notice of the authors that there many deficiencies in the manuscript which needs to be removed or improved before further consideration for publication in
JMCR.

1. The most important limitation of the manuscript is the grammar. Whole manuscript is full of grammatical errors which make the manuscript “difficult to read” therefore diluting its message. Therefore, I would suggest that the manuscript should be thoroughly checked for the errors.

2. Authors have included so many references (36 for a case report!). Please keep the number of references maximum to 15.

3. Authors claim that there is only one case report. There are more cases reported metastases to Carpal bone. Few of the reports are sited below. These can be sited in the manuscript.

4. Under competing interest section – authors have written (by mistake) the contributions of different authors. Please read the guidelines for authors at JMCR site for the detail. http://www.jmedicalcasereports.com/authors/instructions.

5. The discussion may be more focused to keep the readers’ interest alive.