Reviewers report

Title: Static winging of the scapula caused by osteochondroma in adults - a case series

Version: 1 Date: 1 September 2012

Reviewer: Farzad Omidi-Kashani

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

• Dynamic winging of scapula can also be caused by paralysis of trapezius muscle (spinal accessory nerve). In this condition, winging occurs when the patient abducts the shoulder to 90 degrees; in contrast with the paralysis of long thoracic nerve that winging occurs when the patient does 90 degrees forward flexion. this point should be mentioned.

• In the Figure 1, in the column of dynamic winging, iatrogenic section, the author should also mention; “positional” (during patient positioning in lateral decubitus surgery, as we reported in: Ameri E, Behtash H, Omidi-Kashani F. Isolated long thoracic nerve paralysis - a rare complication of anterior spinal surgery: a case report. J Med Case Rep. 2009 Jun 23; 3: 7366.

Revisions necessary for publication
• Cases: It’s better to note: true lateral radiograph (instead of oblique or lateral radiograph) of her right scapula

• Case 2: the author said “they performed neurolysis when the pain was not disappeared after tumoral resection” . I have a question. Do they have a document to do a neurolysis after decompression? For example, in chronic sciatica, when the patient has a chronic pain for several months or years, we do not expect immediate pain relief after surgical decompression. In this case, why was neurolysis immediately performed after tumor resection? Is it not better to have a little patience?

Quality of written English: Acceptable