Reviewer’s report

Title: Percutaneous evacuation of diffuse pulmonary interstitial emphysema by lung puncture in an extremely low birth weight infant: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 10 May 2012

Reviewer: Shantanu Rastogi

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Other

If other, please specify:

Possible method of treating a established disease in preterm neonates

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Response:

The authors demonstrate the efficacy of lung puncture as the treatment for PIE in preterm neonates. This case of interest to the neonatologist in situations where the neonates is critically sick and intervention such as single lung ventilation and/or surgical intervention will take too much time or potentially be harmful in a unstable situation.

The potential explanation offered by the authors is unlikely for the results they
had obtained. Despite interconnections within the small cysts in PIE as stated by the authors they cannot be drained by as single puncture which then would make this the method of choice of treating PIE. As with the sudden deterioration, clinical symptoms suggestive of tension pneumothorax, removal of air by single site puncture and quick response points towards a giant emphysema or a large bullae. Also as observed in the third x-ray the small cysts characteristic of PIE remain after the drainage has been performed also is an evidence against draining PIE cysts by single puncture. It would be useful for the readers to consider giant bullae in sudden change in clinical condition and these cases can be helped by the method described by the authors and cautions the readers for using this method in all cases of PIE

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no conflict of interest with this manuscript