Reviewer's report

Title: True parachute mitral valve in an asymptomatic adult patient - a case report

Version: 2 Date: 9 October 2011

Reviewer: John Purvis

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The authors have submitted impressive and unusual images - the images alone are worthy of publication. Adult PMV is usually part of a Shone complex - it rarely occurs in isolation and usually presents as a mild congenital mitral stenosis NOT regurgitation. Redundant anterior chordae can be part of an APMV but this case seems rather extreme!

This case is NOT at all typical of APMV but may represent a forme fruste. The images presented best resemble a case of ".....exuberant accessory mitral valve tissue....." - Eur J Echocardiogr 2011:12 ;655 - that case also presented as a mitral regurg/murmur and also had a mesh of net-like chordae - This case is much more impressive!
The appellation of APMV in this case seems to rest on a single short axis image showing one papillary muscle - the supplementary videos however suggest a possible second chordal attachment/papillary muscle may be present (see posterior leaflet).

Overall I would suggest a revision of the title to "Mitral regurgitation and exuberant accessory mitral valve tissue with possible APMV" - I am reluctant to fully accept this as a true APMV without either 1. the presence of co-arct, bicuspid AV etc or 2. better images of papillary muscles.

I do however, believe that the images are very valuable and should be published with the above caveats. This case really should be SO much more than another APMV report.

(The quality of English in the manuscript was sometimes quite poor and I feel the authors would need some help with this).

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

No