Reviewer's report

Title: Patient with ring chromosome15 20-years cytogenetic and molecular follow-up: a case report.

Version: 2 Date: 19 December 2011

Reviewer: Cecilia Gunnarsson

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Other

If other, please specify:

Long term followup in a unusual case is always of value in the clinical part of view

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This is a well written case report with a long time follow up- However I have some questions:

1)Is it only a deletion on 15q? Couldnt you see a smaller deletion on terminal15p? In the case of ringchromoosmes you usually sees a terminal deletion on both arms- even if one of them can be rather small. Can you try to explain why you don’t see a terminal deletion on 15p?
2) Have the parents been investigated? In that case - you can present it, and if you have done an array on the parents you can show the array results beside the child.

Quality of written English: Acceptable