Reviewer's report

Title: Early duodenal adenocarcinoma resembling submucosal tumor cured with endoscopic resection: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 7 March 2012

Reviewer: Rudolf Mennigen

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This is an interesting case report of a small duodenal adenocarcinoma which has been cured by endoscopic resection.

Several questions / issues have to be clarified:

1) Did the patient have any symptoms?
2) Please provide details concerning the medical history of the patient.
3) How do you explain the delay of six months between diagnosis and surgical therapy?
4) Figures 1a and 1b basically show the same image, one of the figures should be deleted.
5) Please comment on the applied technique of endoscopically resection (snare? sumucosal dissection?)

6) Please comment on the exact location of the tumor, especially the distance to the papilla of Vater.

7) Discussion: You "reviewed several reports and invétigated the clinicopathological features of 27 lesions in 27 patients." The cited literature (3-5), however, includes three case reports. So which literature is the basis of your review of the literature? Perhaps a brief table with key facts of reported cases so far would be helpful.

8) Please add the following topics to your discussion:
Role of endoscopic ultrasound in planning endoscopic resection, accuracy of endoscopic ultrasound; endoscopic resection as "total biopsy", if resection incomplete, duodenopancreatectomy can still be performed; relation of the tumor to the papilla of Vater (endoscopic resection feasible?); prognosis of duodenal cancer.

9) Please provide exact pTNM status after resection.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.