Reviewer's report

Title: Primary follicular lymphoma of the epididymis positive for t(14;18)(q32;q21)/IGH-BCL2 and negative for BCL2 protein expression: a case report

Version: 3 Date: 23 October 2011

Reviewer: Russell Ryan

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The most significant material change in the revised manuscript is that the authors report testing two separate BCL2 antibodies, both of which were negative in the tumor cells. This reduces the likelihood of a false negative result (failure to detect BCL2 protein despite tumor cell expression) due to somatic hypermutation, although it does not entirely rule out the possibility - per the product info on these two monoclonals, I believe the peptides used to generate them are partially overlapping.

The author's revisions have generally addressed the factual concerns raised in the reviews, and from a content standpoint, the article is publishable. However, the writing, particularly in the discussion section, is difficult to understand. The
authors need to improve the organization of this section, and the whole article would benefit from English language copyediting.

Two specific minor editing points:
The names of reagent manufacturers should not be in all-caps.
Typo - "tingible-body" not "tangible-body"

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests