Reviewer's report

Title: Abscess of urachal remnants presenting with acute surgical abdominal: a rare presentation (a case series).

Version: 2 Date: 28 December 2011

Reviewer: Nexhmi Hyseni

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The authors present rare cases of Abscess of urachal remnants presenting with acute abdomen. It’s a fact that urachal anomalies very rarely are found in adults, usually as an infected urachal cyst. It is very unfortunate that the many similar articles in the literature have been seen before. Therefore this article has not reached highest priority for publication. Nevertheless I would like to express following suggestions: the cases are coherently presented, but for publication its needs some Major additional corrections.

- So, I suggest the title of the paper should be changed.

Abscess of urachal remnants presenting with acute abdomen: a case series.
- The cases presentation is too long.
- In Introduction, in line 5, should quote the authors who have published the few cases.
- The first description was in 1550 by Cabriolus [1] and then a few cases of urachal remnants were reported in the literature ( ).


- Almost all the author’s references are more than 10 years old.
Suggestions to the author: wives and attach references published in the literature relatively recently.

Below are the new references published in the literature?

1. Allen, Jason W. MD, PhD*; Song, Jean BS†; Velcek, Francisca T. Illustrative Cases-Acute Presentation of Infected Urachal Cysts: Case Report and Review of Diagnosis and Therapeutic Interventions Pediatric Emergency Care: February 2004 - Volume 20 - Issue 2 - pp 108-111


**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'