Reviewer’s report

Title: Abscess of urachal remnants presenting with acute surgical abdominal: a rare presentation (a case series).

Version: 2 Date: 16 December 2011

Reviewer: Mirko B

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Presentations, diagnoses and/or management of new and emerging diseases

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

- General comments

This is an interesting case series of infected urachal remnants with different symptoms and signs

I think that the article needs some revisions for publication in the journal. Urachal remnants are very rare but many article are reported in Literature in recent years and authors should to add other news related to the recent literature.

- Revisions necessary for publication
Discussion II paragraph page 8 line 6-9: this sentence need a reference or must to be deleted. In the most part of infected urachal remnants, the remnant is a cyst and the drainage is not only in the umbilicus or in the bladder.

Discussion VI paragraph page 10 line 2-5: perioperative or pre-operative drainage????????
This is an option but some authors report the excision of infected remnant in children:

Discussion VII paragraph page 10 line 14-15: In Literature there are not only single cases:

Discussion: if you consider laparoscopic excision to complete the numerous technique in discussion you should include also video-assisted removal and single site technique

Conclusion line 6-8 must be revised according with the comments above.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests