Reviewer's report

Title: Peters Anomaly with Post axial Polydactyly, Bilateral Camptodactyly and Club Foot in a Kenyan Neonate: A Case Report.

Version: 1 Date: 4 August 2011

Reviewer: Sara Alquati

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected association between diseases or symptoms

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

In the present manuscript (MS ID:6815595935624033) Dr Aruyaru has described the interesting case of a newborn who presented at birth with Peters anomaly associated with musculoskeletal abnormalities such as polydactyly, camptodactyly, and club foot.

The author states that this association has never been reported.

Overall, in my opinion, this case has been described clearly and coherently.

Herewith some specific observations:

1. The author states that this particular clinical presentation could represent a new syndrome. In my opinion, one case could only be fruit of a coincidence.
Additional cases and investigations are needed to confirm this suggestion.

2. No second level clinical investigations or post-mortem examination have been carried out to describe the detail this pathological picture. This could represent a limitation of this reported case.

3. In order to highlight the uniqueness of this clinical combination of different anomalies, a careful review of the English-language literature on reported cases of Peters anomaly would significantly improve the value of this manuscript. I suggest to organise and show the result of this review in a tabular form.”

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests