Title: Incidental renal cell carcinoma in an autosomal dominant polycystic kidney disease patient who underwent simultaneous bilateral native nephrectomy and living donor renal transplantation: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 28 January 2012

Reviewer: Yongguang Yang

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

None.

Quality of written English: Acceptable