Reviewer's report

Title: Acute tubulointerstitial nephritis complicating Legionnaires' Disease: a case report.

Version: 2 Date: 22 November 2011

Reviewer: Dieter Scholtze

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

TITLE: Acute tubulointerstitial complicating Legionnaires`Disease: a case report.

The report includes a nice summary of the case along with investigations (biochemistry and renal biopsy) and the treatment the patient received.

Although they intend to show that this is a case Legionella associated with AIT, I have a few worries about this case.

1. They have not fully convinced us that the said patient had Legionella infection:
   i. A patient with that degree of lung involvement will have sputum positive test which has been shown to have better sensitivity and specificity at diagnosing Legionella than other tests (see: Roig J, Rello J. Legionnaires' disease: a rational approach to therapy. J Antimicrob Chemother. 2003 May;51(5):1119-29)
ii. Could the urine test for Legionella antigen be false-positive?

iii. Was a source of Legionella infection founded? If yes, then it should be clearly stated.

2. We found no other tests to exclude other possibilities for AIT. There are no serologies for other infectious diseases or especially there were no tests for an systemic disease.

3. The normal reference ranges for some values provided in the text should be provided.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare I have no competing interests