Reviewer’s report

Title: Revision of a nonunited subtrochanteric femoral fracture around a failed intramedullary nail with the use of RIA products, BMP-7 and hydroxyapatite: A case report

Version: 3 Date: 14 November 2010

Reviewer: Mahbub Alam

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Other

If other, please specify:
A combined application of recognised treatments of a complication of surgical treatment in a new clinical or anatomical setting

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The answer to comment 2 i think is important in that, in current practice, it is likely that either a combination of RIA and HA cement or BMP-7 and HA cement would be used in most centres when faced with this scenario. However, the approach taken in your manuscript is set out in an organised manner in terms of biology & biomechanics. Therefore it is worth publishing & will generate discussion.
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'