Reviewer’s report

Title: Collapsing glomerulopathy in Sickle cell disease Unveiled - A cryptic tale

Version: 2 Date: 4 January 2010

Reviewer: J.K.J. Deegens

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Other

If other, please specify:

A rare association between diseases, described only a few previous case reports

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This case report describes an association between sickle cell disease and collapsing glomerulopathy. The case report is interesting and adds to a previous case report showing this association.

However, the paper is rather difficult to read. Many abbreviations are used, some of which are not spelt out. Laboratory data are provided without units. Parts of the discussion are difficult to read because it is not always evident if the authors refer to FSGS, collapsing glomerulopathy or collapsing glomerulopathy caused by SCD. Finally, the paper should be checked for grammar and spelling.
Specific comments

Page 3:

“Renal failure occurs with high frequency in patients with nephrotic syndrome”. Should this not be “in patients with nephrotic syndrome and sickle cell disease”? What does the abbreviation SCA mean?

“In the literature there are only few reports of collapsing FSGS”. Please provide references. What does the abbreviation SOB mean? Retic count should be spelt out.

The laboratory results are provided without units.

Page 4

According to the morphological classification of FSGS, overlying podocyte hypertrophy and hyperplasia on light microscopy is an important feature of collapsing FSGS. The authors should report whether or not this feature was present in the renal biopsy.

How many glomeruli were present in the renal biopsy and how many of these glomeruli exhibited collapsing FSGS? Was electron microscopic examination performed? Were there signs of erythrocyte sickling in the glomerular capillaries?

“However the clinical improvement in patients with CG…” This sentence suggests that collapsing glomerulopathy frequently remits. However, in contrast to other forms of FSGS, collapsing glomerulopathy has a poor prognosis. These patients are more likely to progress to ESRD and do not attain a remission.

Different abbreviations are used for homozygous sickle cell disease, SCD-SS or SS.

Page 5

The authors state that FSGS causes about 10-15% of all cases of nephrotic syndrome in SS of SCN. Please provide references.

Second paragraph: It is postulated… and idiopathic. These sentences are confusing. Are the authors referring to FSGS in general or to collapsing glomerulopathy.

Third paragraph: CG is now recognized… seems to be a duplication of the previous paragraph. This paragraph and the second paragraph should be rewritten to obtain a more comprehensive review of collapsing glomerulopathy.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests