Reviewer's report

Title: Asymptomatic presentation of huge extradural hematoma in a patient with arachnoid cyst (Case report and review of the literature)

Version: 1 Date: 24 June 2011

Reviewer: banu prakash

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: None

If other, please specify:

case report of EDH in arachnoid cyst

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

1. the title of asymptomatic should be changed as the patient was symptomatic
2. indication for CT in trivial trauma in patients with abnormal skull shapes also should be restricted to symptomatic patients because many might have minor bleed which wouldn't need intervention until n unless we need to document for medico-legal severity of injury and compensation.
3. the differential of porencephalic cyst is more striking than an arachnoid cyst as the ventricle seems to communicate. please show the other images. pre op or
follow up MRI would characterise the cyst as it would show on diffusion if it is
loculated or communicating with ventricle. I would prefer to do MRI instead of CT
as in India it is not difficult to get MRI time slot, so that we can avoid radiation
while we get more information in conscious patients.

4. Please include corresponding cuts in pre and post op images, date of the study
in the image

5. The description of chronic EDH is w.r.t. bleeds without associated cyst, so
subacute bleeds are totally hyperdense because the serum get absorbed from
the surrounding. Since the pressure head from dural side is not high due to high
yielding cyst it persists in the collection to give this variegated picture, so this is
still a subacute bleed. MRI could have been better to age the bleed.

Hope you could feel at craniotomy for the EDH wouldn’t have popped out like
other cases

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'