Reviewer's report

Title: Guillain Barre syndrome presented as sensory disturbance following a herpes virus infection

Version: 2 Date: 18 June 2011

Reviewer: Ken-ichi Kaida

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: None

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General comments:
This case report states that cross-reactivity between human herpes viruses may play a pathogenic role in the development of postinfectious neuropathy such as Guillain-Barré syndrome (GBS). Authors’ point of view is interesting, but quite speculative. There is no evidence supporting the cross-reactivity between human herpes viruses in the present case. The authors should confirm the cross-reactivity in patient’s serum by experiments such as an immunoprecipitation technique or immunoabsorption study using glycolipids or glycoproteins purified from EBV or CMV. Furthermore, the authors must examine antiganglioside antibodies, which is helpful for diagnosis of GBS and presumption of pathogens of preceding infection.
Revisions necessary for publication:
1. The authors should describe neurological findings and clinical course of the patient in detail; cranial nerves, pyramidal signs, muscle power assessed by manual muscle testing, vibratory sensation, cerebellar or sensory ataxia, response to immunotherapy, and so on. It should be clearly described why the presented case was diagnosed as GBS.
2. It is unclear why additional IVIG (40g x 3 days) was administered. The elevation of CSF albumin does not indicate exacerbation of the disease.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.