Reviewer's report

Title: Gilles de la Tourette syndrome in a patient with 47(xxx) syndrome: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 8 September 2011

Reviewer: A E Cavanna

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

I enjoyed reading this case report of co-morbid Tourette syndrome (TS) and triple X syndrome.

I think this co-morbid presentation is worth reporting. However, the main problem with this paper is the lack of discussion about the TS presentation (tic list, tic severity, tic-related symptoms etc.). There is extensive literature on TS in patients with learning disabilities which the authors do not mention. Moreover, the findings presented in Table 1 are not adequately discussed. The evidence for executive dysfunction in TS populations should be presented in a more systematic way (again, there is vast literature which is overlooked, including recent studies on theory of mind and social cognition in TS). Most of the text in the 'Conclusion' section should be part of the 'Discussion' section.
Finally, the English text needs to be reviewed by a native speaker.

Examples of sentences in need of linguistic revision:

- They seem to share some psychopathological comorbidities (such as anxiety); while however the clinical presentation of Gilles de la Tourette syndrome is well described, 47 (XXX) is much rarer and has a broader spectrum of possible phenotypic presentations.

- We will describe a case of a girl with prenatal diagnosis of triple X syndrome that presents mental retardation and symptoms of Gilles de la Tourette syndrome.

- An 11 year-old girl was examined on suspicious of an anxiety disorder.

- Parents referred also traits of marginalization by peers.

- General physical examination was normal, a part from partial teeth malposition.

- Our patient presented a case of XXX syndrome which can be seen as “intermediate” in terms of expression, as she did not present malformative signs but had mental retardation (with the typical pattern of lower verbal compared to performance IQ).

Example of unfinished sentence:

- Frequently associated symptoms include coprolalia, Obsessive Compulsive Disorder (or obsessive traits).

Other minor issues:

The authors refer to “Tourette syndrome”, “Gilles de la Tourette’s syndrome” and “TS” throughout the manuscript.

References 9 and 14 are the same.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.