Author's response to reviews

Title: Acetabular fractures following rugby tackles in two men: a case report.

Authors:
Daniel W Good (goodd@tcd.ie)
Michael Leonard (michael.leonard@amnch.ie)
Darren Lui (darren.lui@amnch.ie)
Seamus Morris (seamus.morris@amnch.ie)
John P McElwain (john.mcelwain@amnch.ie)

Version: 4 Date: 23 August 2011

Author's response to reviews: see over
Manuscript: MS: 2098017212564968

23rd August 2011

To: Journal of Medical Case Reports Editorial team

Dear Editorial team,

Manuscript: MS: 2098017212564968

Two acetabular fractures following rugby tackles: a case report.

Thank you for your letter and the opportunity to resubmit this article. We are grateful for your time devoted to reading our paper and to your referees for their insightful comments. The manuscript has been revised in accordance with the recommendations made and is attached for your consideration.

The specific responses to the reviewers’ comments are as follows.

Reviewer 1:

Reviewers comments
The manuscript describes an interesting injury situation and is timely with the advancement of training techniques in contact sports such as rugby union. The case studies are relevant, appropriate and highlight the discussion in the manuscript.

Specific comments:
The following are forwarded to authors as recommendations for changes to the structure of the manuscript. The content is sound and does not need amending

Abstract:
Case presentation: Change to “in a 6-month period from July to December two open reduction and internal fixations of acetabular fractures were performed who sustained their injuries in rugby tackles”

This has been modified as requested.

Introduction
1st Paragraph
2nd sentence remove “in Europe”

This has been modified as requested.

3rd Paragraph
1st sentence: Change to “In a 6-month period from July to December two open reduction and internal fixations of acetabular fractures were performed who sustained their injuries in rugby
tackles"

This has been modified as requested.

2nd sentence change “into the study” to “in the study”

This has been modified as requested.

**Case presentation: Case 1**

1st Paragraph

1st sentence: change “…male who was playing” to “…male playing school rugby”

This has been modified as requested.

2nd sentence: Change to read “Running with the ball he was tackled first from his left causing him to stumble to his right”

This has been modified as requested.

3rd sentence: Change to read “He was again tackled by another…..”

This has been modified as requested.

4th sentence: Change to read “Taken to his local hospital images of his pelvis…”

This has been modified as requested.

5th sentence: Change to read “This was reduced inter-operatively within 2-hours. Postoperatively he was transferred….”

This has been modified as requested.

6th sentence: Change to read “…under anaesthesia revealed instability of the joint. We elected to undertake…”

This has been modified as requested.

8th sentence: Change to read “.. and was discharged on the third post-operative day. He remained non weight bearing…..”

This has been modified as requested.

**Case 2:**

1st Paragraph

1st sentence: Change to read “…male playing amateur rugby…”

This has been modified as requested.

2nd sentence: Change to read “…tackled from his left side causing him to…”

This has been modified as requested.

3rd sentence: Change to read “…another player from his left causing him to land…”
This has been modified as requested.

6th sentence: Change to “He was transferred to…”

This has been modified as requested.

8th sentence: Change to: Post-operative recovery was uneventful and he was discharged on the third day. He remained non-weight bearing…”

This has been modified as requested.

Discussion
No Discussion heading – please add
1st Paragraph
Second sentence: Change to read “The two injuries would normally…”

This has been modified as requested.

3rd Paragraph
2nd sentence: Change to “Most injuries in rugby occur during the tackle phase (…”

This has been modified as requested.

3rd sentence: Change to “The tackled player has twice the incidence of injury than the tackler[7], with one third of injuries occurring when there is a difference in tackling speeds[7] (lower momentum player having four times the injury incidence)[9]. This is also mirrored…”

This has been modified as requested.

4th Paragraph
1st sentence: Change to “The literature is consistent…”

This has been modified as requested.

3rd sentence: Change to “Hip injuries account for only 2% of injuries to the lower limb, with the thigh…”

This has been modified as requested.

5th Paragraph
5th sentence: Change to “JFR during walking is approximately 2.5 x body weight (BW), 4.8 x BW during jogging and 8 x BW during stumbling[16].”

This has been modified as requested.

6th Paragraph
6th sentence: Change to “….are seen in the smallest of defects[19].”

This has been modified as requested.

7th sentence: Please insert a reference for this statement and change to read “…increased contact area and peak pressures in the superior aspect of the acetabulum. This is also associated with decreased pressures in…”

This has been modified as requested.
Reviewer 2:
No responses requested.

We kindly thank reviewer No 2 for their kind and insightful comments.

Editorial team comments:

1. Please include a title page as page 1. The title page should include the title, authors, author affiliations and corresponding author details.

   This has been modified as requested.

2. Please include the ethnicity, sex and age of the patient in the abstract

   This has been modified as requested.

3. Please insert a separate header for the Conclusion section

   This has been modified as requested.

4. Please reformat the title. For example: A presenting with B in C: a case report

   This has been modified as requested and is now: Acetabular fractures following rugby tackles in two young men: a case report.

5. Please replace the header ?Conflict of Interest declaration? to ?Competing Interest?

   This has been modified as requested.

6. As the patient in Case 1 is a minor, please could you confirm that you have obtained written informed consent from the patient?s legal guardian for publication of the case. Your consent statement should be modified accordingly.

   This has been modified as requested.

7. Please restructure the authors contribution section. We suggest the following kind of format (please use initials to refer to each author's contribution): FC analyzed and interpreted the patient data regarding the hematological disease and the transplant. RH performed the histological examination of the kidney, and was a major contributor in writing the manuscript. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

   This has been modified as requested.
8. Please remove any text from figure two which may reveal the patient’s identity (e.g. patient’s number, patient’s name, dates, etc)

   This has been modified as requested.

9. Please place the following sections after the Conclusion in this order:

   Consent
   Competing interest
   Authors? contribution
   References
   Figure legends
   Figures

   This has been modified as requested.

Thank you sincerely for reconsidering this manuscript for publication in the Journal of Medical Case Reports. I hope that the changes made adequately address the issues in your correspondence.

Yours sincerely

Dr Daniel Good on behalf of all co-authors.