Reviewer’s report

Title: Clinical response to Auron Misheil therapy treatment in a patient with advanced multifocal hepatocellular carcinoma: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 2 February 2011

Reviewer: Giuseppe Lombardi

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Other

If other, please specify:

Enexpected response of a treatment

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Dear authors,

this case report might be interesting but deserves some consideration:

1) You write in "case presentation" section that patient started the treatment on September 11, 2008 but on January 30, 2009 the patient has a suspected adrenal involvemnt, thus the time to progression may be only 4 month. This value is lower than one obtained with standard sorafenib treatment (Llovet et al, NEJM,
2008) that was 5.5 months. So your treatment might be interesting if you can demonstrate by a biopsy or a MRI or a rational deduction that the lesion is not an adrenal metastasis to have a TTP 9 months.

2) You write in "case presentation section" that ..."the patient refused sorafenib therapy"..but why? Explain in more detail!

3) You write in "case presentation section" that .."the patient complained about dizziness during AMT and requested to terminate treatmen". Is this the only side effect? Are there other side effects? Explain in more detail!

4) In the "introduction section" the reference number 7 is not recent. Please insert a more recent review.

5) In the "introduction section" you write "HCCs are mostly resistant to chemotherapy". I suggest you mention the recent paper of Lombardi G, Zustovich F, et al (Cancer 2011) about the effectiveness of pegylated liposomal doxorubicin and gemcitabine in the treatment of HCC.

6) In the "discussion section" might to speak about the possible role of this treatment in the patients with Child-Pugh B or C in which sorafenib treatment is not recommended.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests