Reviewer's report

Title: "Hereditary hyperferritinaemia cataract syndrome - first cases in Switzerland?"

Version: 1 Date: 30 May 2011

Reviewer: Domenico Girelli

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: None

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

REVISIONS NECESSARY FOR PUBLICATION

Major points:

• “HE” is not an acronym actually used for hereditary hemochromatosis: please use HH.

• Since the Authors claim that these are the first cases to be diagnosed in Switzerland, it should be useful to have information about the geographical origin of the two families.

• Discussion, first sentence: please start with “HFE-related HH” rather than simply with “hemochromatosis”, since the latter term generically includes also rare forms like those related to TfR2, HJV, HAMP and Ferroportin genes.
• Discussion about a transferrinemia: it has not been described recently. Indeed, the first description was done in 1961 (in Switzerland!). Please cite: Heilmeyer L, Keller W, Vivell O, Betke K, Wöhler F, Keiderling W. Die kongenitale Atransferrinämie. Schweiz Med Wochenschr 1961; 91:1203.

• Discussion about aceruloplasminemia: this disease is always characterized by neurological symptoms, although indeed diabetes is generally the first manifestation. Please delete “with or without” (neurological symptoms).

• Discussion about ferritin: please insert “Under normal conditions,” before “serum ferritin values correlate quite precisely with body iron stores…”.

• Moreover, glycosylated (G) ferritin is only present in serum. Rephrase as follows: “Ferritin, the intracellular iron storage molecule, is a heteropolymer composed of 24 subunits, H and L, variously assembled. On the other hand, serum ferritin consists mainly of L subunits which can also be glycosylated (G).”

• I do not completely agree on the sentence: “Genetic confirmation should be obtained”. Typical cases, i.e. those with otherwise unexplained hyperferritinemia co-segregating with autosomal dominant juvenile cataract are sufficiently diagnosed by medical history and biochemical analyses. Please address this point.

• I do not understand the meaning of the final sentence: “In the recent discovery of new proteins involved in the iron metabolism, we consider it as useful to know the clinical picture of HHCS.” It should be rephrased or even deleted.

Examples of type errors/language inconsistencies
• abstract line 8: gene sequencing
• page 3, first patient’s description: “highly elevated” (tautology)
• Discussion: “In our patients the reasons for ordering the ferritin values were not apparent. “A high ferritin value and a normal transferring saturation in an otherwise healthy young adult virtually excludes HFE-related hemochromatosis”. (please correct transferrin also throughout the paper)
• Some sentences need complete rewording: for instance: “In no other up to know examined body part in HHCS was another accumulation of L-Ferritin found”. Rephrase as: No involvement of organs other than the eye have been reported in patient’s series until now (cite: Girelli D et al. Brit J Haematol 2001; 115:334-340).

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests