Reviewer's report

Title: Effect of GH replacement therapy in a boy with Dent's disease

Version: 2 Date: 28 February 2011

Reviewer: Phyllis Speiser

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: Other

If other, please specify:

GH treatment of short stature in Dent disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Abstract & Discussion: This is a single case report of a boy followed for 3 years during growth hormone treatment for short stature in the setting of Dent disease. The authors fail to acknowledge up front that at least one prior report describes the use of GH in Dent disease (Ref #10: J Pediatr Endocrinol Metab. 2008; 21:279-86). In that publication, partial GH deficiency is described. Of course it is widely understood among pediatric endocrinologists that ~75% of such arbitrarily termed GH deficiency is a temporary, functional state of inadequate GH production, rather than a true inborn error of somatotropin cell development. Thus, the question is not so much whether GH is deficient, but rather whether
GH is therapeutic for growth and/or kidney function in the setting of Dent Disease. Clearly, one cannot answer that question based on a single case. It is worth noting, however, that the height SDS did improve during GH treatment and that renal function remained stable.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests