Reviewer's report

Title: Bardet-Biedl Syndrome with end stage kidney disease at an early age: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 7 April 2010

Reviewer: ALPARSLAN AE ERSOY

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease and an unexpected association between diseases or symptoms

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: No

Comments to authors:

The authors report a case of Bardet-Biedl Syndrome with end-stage renal disease. BBS is a significant genetic cause of chronic renal failure in children. It is a relatively rare pleiotropic syndrome. Therefore, I think that this case can be educative for the readers. However, I have some concerns regarding the complex presentation:

• Firstly, the case report section should describe the presentation of the index case. A figure of family pedigree including affected and unaffected individuals
can befit. Then, the presentation should continue with two relatives who had BBS.

- The discussion section should contain BBS genes and ciliary origins of kidney disease in BBS, shortly.
- A separate table showing renal abnormalities is created.
- There are a few mistakes in usage of abbreviations (BBS, Hb) and word errors (involvement etc) in the text.
- References are reevaluated according to the journal’s rules (especially authors: et al use!, journal name: Kidney Int/ Kidney. Int./ Kidney Int.?).

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.